

Arlington Historic District Commissions

January 23, 2014
Whittemore Robbins House

Final & Approved Minutes

Commissioners Present: D. Baldwin, C. Barry, B. Cohen, J. Cummings, C. Hamilton, S. Makowka, M. Penzenik (arrived 8:30pm), J. Worden

Commissioners Not Present: J. Black, M. Logan, J. Nyberg,

Guests: M. Noonan, M. Walsh, S. Walsh, B. Botterio, R. Fredieu, D. Artley, D. Garrity

1. **AHDC Meeting Opens** 8:00pm
2. **Appointment of alternate Commissioners to Pleasant Street** – C. Barry, M. Bush, J. Cummings, C. Hamilton, S. Makowka. (S. Makowka will abstain from 2nd hearing - 111 Pleasant Street)
3. **Approval of draft minutes from December 19, 2013 and Joint AHDC/AHC meeting on 1/13/14.** J. Worden moved to table 12/19/13 minutes for additional review, M. Bush seconded. All approved tabling 12/19/13 minutes. D. Baldwin moved approval of 1/13/14 draft minutes, seconded by M. Bush, unanimous approval for 1/13/14 minutes.
4. **Communications**
 - a. Application for CONA for 11 Russell Terrace for windows and siding repairs and replacements
 - b. Email re: 26 Academy Street update for informal hearing (Wright) potential garage – will be coming in February for informal and formal in March.
 - c. S. Makowka talked with C. Kowalski for cost estimates on driveway surfaces and she promised to get info from designer to S. Makowka. He will schedule a meeting to give feedback from joint meeting.
 - d. S. Makowka had communication about discussion of Arlington Committee on Tourism and Economic Development (A-TED) and potential designing of consistent signage. Some discussion about bringing Districts into mix of things. C. Rowe asked for commitment ideas for funding – they ball-parked \$15,000 for signs. Discussion that HDC supports project repair and replacement of HD signs and that we would be a co-sponsor. J. Worden moved approval of support of Warrant Article as proposed in C. Rowe's email to S. Makowka. Seconded by M. Bush. Unanimous approval.
 - e. M. Penzenik received communications from contractor for house on Academy and they advised that they put in single glazed windows with storm windows.
5. **New Business**

Hearings (typically last around 20 minutes per application) 8:20pm

 1. Continuation of Formal Hearing re: Lot 47 (aka 247 Pleasant Street) for revisions for previously approved new construction. New plans presented to Commissioners (S. Makowka, D. Baldwin, C. Barry, C. Hamilton, M. Penzenik, J. Worden) who have

been at previous meetings are voting. Extended bay from 4' to 5'6" on the dining room. Put windows on either side of bay so it is well lit on rear of house. 4 windows on back and 2 on side. In keeping with many suggestions did a lot of work on the front. Found carriage style door. Changed klinker brick with bluestone cap. Stoops and column bases changed. Put walls sconce to left of door. Took brick out of second level and put stucco in there as well as stucco to replace siding over garage door. Building stucco with brick base at projecting gables. Master bedroom with two French doors onto balcony is a sided façade. One to left also set back with window pushed over to corner with larger corner board. J. Worden asked about fabric below window – it is roof. Side gable comes through. S. Makowka asked architects about taking out strong horizontal element on front bay it creates a big stucco area – both said it is OK. M. Penzenik said this is a big improvement. C. Barry asked about vertical half timbers and B. Cohen said it would look like a stripe. M. Noonan said he has seen some textured finishes and liked it and is open minded to texture materials. On left side façade (A05) is pretty much the same but water table added around building. M. Penzenik asked if it is to the left or right on garage doors on front elevation. Discussion that stucco goes all the way down to the ground and they were not planning on the water table. M. Penzenik said on front elevation where there is the horizontal board under windows it doesn't wrap on right side and maybe it should because that is stucco as well. S. Makowka said some discussion about chimney. This is designed around having fireplace and chimney where it is on the drawings. It may be a masonry or brick or wood but used as a chimney for fireplaces. S. Makowka said on original design more decorative chimney more visible from Pleasant Street, in new location it is not as visible and is small. What about a faux chimney visible from front. B. Cohen said typically they would be on the outside of the house. There are a few on Pleasant Street. B. Cohen and M. Penzenik said they have no problem with only one chimney. M. Penzenik commented rear elevation is very successful (A06) but she does have a question on (A07) was a garage door with roof on it. Discussion of removing roof over door to garage. S. Makowka said no problem leaving that optional and up to monitor.

Discussion to have half timber look with wrap around on left and right took place. Probably do something on front roof. Specify 2 instead of 3 panel on front door. Maybe some decorative panel in stucco on front. D. Baldwin moved to accept new plans as presented and dated 1/10/2014 with changes made at meeting for change to wrap around horizontal timbering element on right and left hand side, right roof over door to be optional with final approval by monitor,, chimney fine as is, decorative stucco on front tower to be approved option, final material selection (i.e. door, windows, etc) to be approved by monitor prior to installation, seconded by C. Barry. Unanimous approval. J. Nyberg will continue as monitor.

DOCUMENTATION PRESENTED: New plans and drawings with narrative dated 10 January 2014.

2. Formal Hearing re: 111 Pleasant Street (Fredieu) for awning installations. R. Fredieu said hurricane destroyed original awnings. They would like to upgrade to a copper awning on right side towards rear of side façade. The canvas awnings were damaged in winds. Looking to replace with same functionality but better material. Replacement of upper left hand corner awning. Addition of two new awnings to ones in existence being replaced. B. Cohen moved approval of all awnings including new ones as well as replacement of copper awning over door on side of house. Seconded by M. Bush. S. Makowka suggested leave final approval subject to monitor prior to installation. Unanimous approval. Monitor C. Hamilton appointed.

DOCUMENTATION PRESENTED: Various awning options, photos, drawings

3. Continuation of Informal Hearing re: 39 Russell Street for addition. Discussion about zoning bylaw which required that when a condo is made out of two structures, that it

be a townhouse basically where the common wall goes full height. M. Penzenik said this makes sense to have an assemblage. J. Cummings said it is appropriately scaled, as looking from Summer Street. Discussion about the zoning requirements but that is not under our jurisdiction. S. Makowka said are we telling the Zoning Board that we are approving a project if it gets built, but we are not telling them that from the historic perspective the building dept. should make any variance based on the HDC, (e.g. sometimes we ask the building dept. to allow a porch railing to be a certain height which differs from regulations). M. Penzenik commented that when you look at drawing there is a random white band. That shouldn't be there. S. Makowka asked if the roofs are the same on the middle and back building. They each seem to step down. It does – not a problem. Question is because that is all one level – your windows progressively move in to the tabature in an odd way. B. Cohen said that is common for the period however she would prefer them to be all the same height. M. Penzenik asked why there are brackets on front and side and not on back. Back could be enhanced by having them, it is plain. S. Makowka summarized – feedback on size and massing. Sympathetic in scale and texture with the neighborhood. M. Bush said he is concerned with amount of lot that is being taken up. M. Penzenik asked about sf of footprint – 1st floor addition is 1250 plus existing 1600 plus 500 approx. for garage (total 2400 approx). Out of 16,000sf lot, building something around 4000. M. Penzenik said in terms of it taking up a lot of sf on the property – you looked at amount of space between the two buildings. S. Makowka said if you had to build something this is where I would want it built. You seem to have done the best being sympathetic to the streetscape. Don't want the back to be clashing with the original house and this works. B. Cohen said she actually has no problem with a modern house behind. M. Penzenik asked architect to revisit window heads and encroaching on the entablature. Will need elevations, roof lines, peaks, etc. to know how orientation is actually. Need to show streetscape and how neighboring structures look also. R. Botterio asked about putting small door (4x4 square door in to foundation) to get in to a/c – this would be on back facing summer street. S. Makowka said group concerned with massing, size, relation to District. Strong group thinks right direction. Design – some tweaking discussed tonight. Some commissioners expressed liking design as is and not to change overall feeling. D. Baldwin said it still looks modern.

6. Other Business

- a. Preservation Loan Program Update
- b. Outreach to Neighborhoods & Realtor
- c. Report on Joint AHC/AHDC Meeting 1/13/14

7. OPEN FORUM

Any matter presented for consideration of the Commission shall neither be acted upon, nor a formal decision made the night of the presentation

8. REVIEW OF PROJECTS (See project list below)

Project List:

1. 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. – 10-13P) – Makowka – CONA (Door)
2. 215 Pleasant Street (Gruber – 10-15P) – Penzenik – COA (Garage Door)
3. 193 Westminster (Pemsler - 10-21M) – Cohen – COA (Windows, Siding)
4. 10 Jason Street (Young-Sullivan – 10-32J) – Cohen – COA (Chimney-Skylite)

5. 193 Westminster Ave. (Pernsler – 10-41M) – Cohen – COA (Siding Removal-Clapboard-Windows)
6. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 10-49M) – Makowka – COA (Door)
7. 14 Westmoreland Ave. (Leveille – 10-51M) – Cohen – COA (Siding-Attic Windows)
8. 12 Elder Terrace (Folkers – 10-53M) – Cohen – COA (Garage)
9. 188-190 Westminster Ave. (Kokubo – 11-08M) – Penzenik – COA (Addition-Windows)
10. 69 Crescent Hill Ave. (Bush-Sheldon – 11-13M) – Nyberg – COA (Shingles/Clapboard)
11. 44 Academy Street (Gevalt/Bachrach -11-21P) – Penzenik – COA (Shed)
12. 21 Montague Street (Elwell/Nemec – 11-25M) – Makowka – CONA (Fascia-Porch-Rail)
13. 19 Jason Street (Dargon-Green – 11-40J) – Cohen – COA (Rear Deck-Stairway-Rails on Front)
14. 111 Pleasant Street (Frideau – 11-49) – Nyberg – COA (Fence)
15. 161 Westminster Ave. (Lancelotta – 11-50M) – Black – COA (Gutters)
16. 30-32 Jason Street (Harris/Charest – 12-08J) – Makowka – CONA (Porch Repair)
17. 15-15A Avon Place (Burke – 12-10A) – Black/Nyberg – COA (Main House/Garage Demo/Carriage House Build)
18. 19 Maple Street (Hirani – 12-14P) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters)
19. 734 Mass. Ave. (Davidson – 12-17J) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
20. 214R Pleasant Street (Bisher-Bernstein – 12-22P) Penzenik - COA (House Redesign)
21. 66 Pleasant Street (Fraumeni – 12-30P) – Makowka – CONA (Gutters/Downspouts)
22. 10 Avon Place (Gnewuck – 12-31A) – Makowka – CONA (Shingles)
23. 11 Wellington Street (Herold – 12-36P) – Makowka – CONA (Fence)
24. 10 Avon Place (Gnewuck – 12-37A) – Cohen – COA (Railing)
25. 23 Maple Street (Town of Arl. – 12-38P) – Makowka – COA (Porches-Entry-Fire Esc)
26. 156 Pleasant Street (Seitz – 12-39P) – Penzenik – COA (Windows)
27. 47 Irving Street (Kaplan – 12-40J) Cohen – COA (House Addition)
28. 60 Pleasant Street (Brentwood – 12-44P) – Makowka – CONA (Sliding Doors)
29. 60 Pleasant Street (Brentwood – 12-49P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
30. 119 Pleasant Street (Poulos Trust – 12-53P) – Makowka – CONA (Windows)
31. 30 Jason Street (Harris/Charest – 12-52J) – Nyberg – COA (Porches)
32. 195 Westminster Ave. (Rothstein – 13-01M) – Cohen – COA (Skylights/Tube)
33. 81 Westminster Ave. (Lemire – 13-02M) – Makowka – CONA (Door)
34. 55 Westminster Ave. (Maier/Ching – 13-04M) – Cohen – COA (Windows)
35. 21 Central Street (Dyer – 13-05C) – Cohen – COA (Solar Panels)
36. 75 Pleasant Street (Bos. Church of Christ – 13-07P) – Makowka/Cohen – COA (Annex Renovations/Church Restorations)
37. Lot 47 (aka 247 Pleasant Street- 13-08P) – Nyberg – COA (new house)
38. 204 Pleasant Street (Sirah RT – 13-10P) – Penzenik – COA (Cupola/Windows)
39. 86 Pleasant Street (Coyner – 13-16P) – Makowka – CONA (chimney repair)
40. 7 Jason Terrace (Fredieu – Historical Society – 13-22J) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
41. 15 Wellington Street (Cohen – 13-28P) – Makowka – COA (gutters/fascia/soffits)
42. 208 Pleasant Street (Hart – 13-29P) – Makowka – COA (solar panels)
43. 210 Pleasant Street (Hart – 13-30P) – Makowka – COA (solar panels)
44. 33 Gray Street (Lubar – 13-35J) – Makowka (CONA (stairs and deck)
45. 52-54 Westminster Ave. (O'Shea – 13-38M) – Makowka – CONA (siding)
46. 24 Avon Place (Sayigh – 13-41A) – Makowka – CONA (windows)
47. 109 Westminster Ave. (Rines-Pascale – 13-46M) – Barry – COA (garage)
48. 23 Jason Street (Leary-Hammerman – 13-47J) – Cohen – COA (addition)
49. 161 Westminster Ave. (Lancelotta – 13-48M) – Makowka – COA (fence)
50. 15 Oak Knoll (Lo – 13-52P) – Makowka – CONA (windows, doors)
51. 49 Academy Street (Baldwin – 13-53P) – Worden – COA (steps)
52. 31 Central Street (Sampson/Cummings – 13-54C) – Makowka – COA (addition)
53. 211 Pleasant St. (Stark-McElduff – 13-58P) – Makowka – CONA (roof)

54. 175 Pleasant St. (Lucchese – 13-59P) – Barry – COA (repairs)
55. 10 Central Street (Hedlune – 13-60C) – Baldwin – COA (solar panels)
56. 37 Jason Street (Lees – 13-61J) – Makowka – DENIAL (solar panels)
57. 272 Broadway (Danieli/Crispin – 13-62B) – Makowka – COA (dormer)
58. 216 Pleasant St. (Russell – 13-63P – Bush – COA (soffit vent)
59. 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon – 13-64P) – Cummings – 10 day COA (wall)
60. 24 Central Street (Donnelly/Fisher – 13-65C) – Makowka – CONA (porch/steps)
61. 114 Westminster Ave. (Metzger/Fleming – 13-66M) – Makowka – CONA (fence)
62. 7 Central Street (Sampson – 13-67C) – Makowka – CONA (solar panels)
63. 239 Pleasant Street (McKinnon – 13-68P) – Cummings – COA (stairway/wall/fence/rail)
64. 34 Academy Street (Ellison – 13-69P) – Penzenik – COA (windows, doors, deck)
65. 152 Pleasant Street (Niles – 13-70P) – Bush – COA (gutters)
66. 21 Maple Street K(Theosophical Society – 13-71P) – Makowka – CONA (gutters/fascia)
67. 19 Wellington Street (Kirchheimer – 13-72P) – Makowka – CONA (windows)
68. 135 Pleasant St. Unit 9&10 (Atkinson-Bing – 13-73P) – Makowka – COA (a/c condenser and rear porch door)
69. 20 Russell Street (Martin/Briggs – 13-75R) – Makowka – CONA (gutters)
70. 735 Mass. Ave. (Highrock Church – 13-76J) – Makowka – CONA (roof)
71. 175 Pleasant St. (Lucchese – 13-77P) – Barry – COA (skylight)
72. 17 Irving Street (Town of Arl-Parmenter – 13-78P) – Makowka – DENIAL - fence

Meeting Adjourned 10:20pm